

# Corrigenda of Jinendrabuddhi's Pramāṇasamuccayaṭīkā,

## Chapters 1 and 2

by

Ernst Steinkellner

Since the publication of chapters 1 and 2 of Jinendrabuddhi's *Pramāṇasamuccayaṭīkā* in 2005 and 2012 several translations in Japanese<sup>1</sup> and studies<sup>2</sup> appeared. As far as I see, only Kataoka 2007 and 2011 contain corrections and proposals of emendations in the text itself. Over the years I also collected misprints and necessary corrections, and after finishing the work of collecting citations and reports from both chapters<sup>3</sup> I consider appropriate to provide the corrections and improvements for the two publications found so far. The following proposals for change are limited to the text itself. The two apparatuses (A1 and A2) remain, in general, untouched except for a few definite improvements since it is highly likely that the interpretation presented will still be enriched by further research. There are, for example, cases where the beginning and/or end of certain citations must be changed and other cases where the attribution of a citation is withdrawn or changed in the light of my present research. Such cases are only exceptionally included. When sources still not identified in the edition have meanwhile been ascertained, these are acknowledged.

To begin with I offer my reasons for not accepting some of the proposals for emendation in Kataoka 2007 (summarized in p. 79) and 2011. The lemmata are from the edition.

1,11: *karambakah*. While the Tibetan *za ma tog* represents *karaṇḍakah*, and the word *karambaka* seems to be unknown in Sanskrit dictionaries, I stand by the clear manuscript reading because the Muni Jambuvijaya told me that he knows this word for a “small sweet cake” and that it still exists in Gujarati. The testimony of the translators into Tibetan I consider a *lectio facilior*, for they naturally took the obscure word for being mis-written. For this reason I followed the Muni's wisdom.

---

<sup>1</sup> Kataoka 2007 (with a list of corrections on p. 79), 2011; Yoshida 2010, 2011.

<sup>2</sup> Chu 2004, 2006; Kyūma 2008; Muroya forthc.

<sup>3</sup> To be published by The International Institute for Buddhist Studies, Tokyo 2017.

Subsequently Chlodwig Werba directed me to the *Illustrated Ardha-Magadhi Dictionary* (AMD) that has the word *karaṃba* m. ... and Gujarātī *karaṃbo* in II, 422b as “a food prepared of boiled rice and curds mixed together” with a hapax-reference to the *Pravacanasāroddhāra* by Nemicandra (1934: 230). *karaṃbaka*, nevertheless, does not seem to exist in the dictionaries. It is, however, not a problem that any word can be extended with the productive suffix °*aka*-. Werba also found in Kalhaṇa’s *Rājatarāṅginī* V16d a *karambhakam*, *Acc.Sg.* (glossed as *karambam*) evidently referring to a meal. And this can be connected with PW *karambhá*- m., name of a pappy meal that even god Pūṣan could eat in spite of his bad teeth. For the existence of the de-aspirated variant *karamba*- cf. M. Mayrhofer, *Etymologisches Wörterbuch des Altindoarischen* I, 310.

2,2: *pratyakṣādīpramāṇam*. I think the compound is preferable.

5,3: *udghaṭitadhīviṣayam*. I understand °*viṣayam* as attribute of \**vākyam*, \**vacanam* which is the object of the verb *vyācakṣate*. Thus I see no reason to change against the manuscript. But cf. Kataoka 2007: 25f with note 31 and Muroya forthc.: 18<sup>?</sup> with note 70.

Following Katsura’s reconstitution of the *Nyāyamukha*’s concluding stanza (cf. PST 1. xlvii, note 77, and Katsura 2014: note 3) there are further attempts in Kataoka 2007: 24-26 and Muroya forthc.: 24<sup>?</sup>. The differences concern *pāda* b of the stanza: *kṛtam udghaṭitajñadhīviṣaghnam* (Katsura), *kṛtam udghaṭitajñānām* (Kataoka), and *kṛtam udghaṭitajñadhīviṣānām* or *īritam udghaṭitadhīviṣānām* (Muroya). Muroya draws extensively on the context of interpretation particularly of the compound *dhīviṣa* (Muroya forthc.: 22<sup>?</sup>-24<sup>?</sup>). Since I have no satisfying solution for the many problems involved, I have to leave it at that.

5,11: *prakṛṣṭaḥ pramāṇa*°. Here I think (with Muroya forthc.: 7<sup>?</sup>) that *prakṛṣṭaḥ* belongs to the series of preceding attributes constructed with *pramāṇasamuccayaḥ*.

8,9: *īdṛśeṣu cānupalabdher*. *ca* seems appropriate for connecting the second argument and occurs in the extracted text (PVSV) as well. The next arguments are introduced under the new condition *pumstvēdisāmānye* ’*pi*.

14,10: *paraḥ pālanārtho*. I understand *paraḥ* as attribute of *arthaḥ* in the sense of “a further meaning of saving” of the verb “to save” (*tāyatiḥ*), not as “a meaning of saving others.”

16,10: *codbhāsitam*. I follow the Tibetan translation; the sibilant *ṣ* is only a scribal variant.

22,7: *sataḥ*. I don't think it should be emended to *parataḥ* because this notion is implied in the following °*pramāṇāntaravṛtṭyā*. What is meant is that an ascertaining cognition (*nīścaya*) occurs for that validity which is already extant (*sata eva*), namely as the nature of a means of valid knowledge established by self-awareness.

69,11: *viṣayasyevābhāso 'syeti*. No change is appropriate because this analysis of the compound is contrasted to *viṣaya ābhāso 'syeti* in the next line.

Secondly I present a list of readings in the edition to be changed (>) to the following entry. Accepted corrections from Kataoka 2007 and 2011 are gratefully included.

## Chapter 1

4,8: *vigataprasṛta*° > *vigataprakṛṣṭa*° Ms

6, A1: <sup>b</sup> *Ce* ? > Vyākhyāyukti (ed. Lee) 36,10-13.<sup>4</sup>

8,10f: *sambhāvāt* > *sambhavāt* Ms

10,12: *vāñchāntareṇa* Ms > *vāñchām antareṇa*

13,9: *śeṣam asyeti* > *śeṣam ata iti* Ms

18,11: *evaṃvidhā* > *evaṃvidhāj* Ms

21,10: *tan*° > *tan*°

21, A1: <sup>c</sup> *Ce* ? > Purandara

...NBhū 6,11-12 > NBhū 6,10-12; TSP 528,9-10; TRD 306,14-15)

---

<sup>4</sup> I owe this reference to Wasō Harada.

- 22,1: °virodhilakṣaṇaṃ > °virodhi lakṣaṇaṃ  
 praṇīyet > praṇīyeta
- 22,5: vipralabhyet > vipralabhyeta
- 31,3f: prātkāvad > prāk tāvad
- 66,7: sādṛśyātmano Ms > sādṛśātmano
- 72,15: śubhāśubhādi° > śubhrāśubhrādi° Ms
- 72,16: śubhāśubhādi° > śubhrāśubhrādi° Ms
- 87,4: nānyataḥ, > nānyato Ms
- 87,8: ghaṭajñānaṃ ghaṭajñānam Ms > ghaṭajñānaṃ paṭajñānam em.
- 112, A2: tasmān na nirdiśyate em. > tasmān na nirdiśyate Ms
- 118,5: °ārthasannikarṣaḥ > °ārthasannikarṣe em.  
 °manaḥsannikarṣaḥ > °manaḥsannikarṣe em.
- 118, A2: <sup>2</sup> phrad pa la T for °sannikarṣaḥ > °sannikarṣe em. (phrad pa la T) :  
 °sannikarṣaḥ Ms  
 °sannikarṣo > °sannikarṣe em. : °sannikarṣo Ms
- 125,2: darśanaṃ sparśanaṃ > dārśanaṃ spārśanaṃ em. : darśanaṃ sparśanaṃ Ms
- 137,9: °vad ūrdhvākṣipta° > °vat\* dūrvājalavad Ms
- 137,13: tathā pari° > tathāpari°
- 145,11: riṇamanti > pariṇamanti
- 147,16: 'tīndriyā, > 'tīndriyā
- 156,1: pauraṣeṇa Ms > pauraṣeyeṇa em. (cf. 155,10)
- 160,9f: avyavasāyair > vyavasāyair Ms
- 161,6: pauraṣeṇa Ms > pauraṣeyeṇa pratyayena em.
- 161, A2: add <sup>4a</sup> pauraṣe⟨ye⟩ṇa ⟨pratyayena⟩ em. (cf. 155,10 and 156,1)
- 161, A2: delete note 7
- 169, A2: delete note 12

178,3: delete crux

178, A1: delete “MSūBh<sup>b</sup> → 169<sup>6,39</sup>,”

## Chapter 2

13,15: <sup>g</sup>asya .... – kṣiti<sup>o</sup> > asya .... – <sup>g</sup>kṣiti<sup>o</sup>

14,11: *grahaṇād ity .... anumānam //* <sup>(13,15-)g</sup> > *grahaṇād*<sup>(13,15-)g</sup> *ity ... anumānam //*

74,12: *vātāna*<sup>o\*</sup> > *ātāna*<sup>o</sup> Ms

74,A2: note 12 to be deleted

76,6: *prakāśād* Ms > *sakāśād* em. (*gsal bar byed pa las* T)

87,A2, *na brūmaḥ* – <sup>d</sup>abhāvo > <sup>d</sup>na brūmaḥ – abhāvo

note 2: Kellner 2009 > Kellner 2010

note 9: <sup>o</sup>viśeṣa<sup>o</sup> (twice) > <sup>o</sup>viśeṣa

93,1f: *paramatenāsambhavād* > *paramatena sambhavād*

93,A2, note 1-2: *paramatenāsambhavād* em. > *paramatena sambhavād* em. (with evidence of T to follow Ms)

94,9: *prati bhāvas* > *pratibhāvas*

94,10: *prati bhāvaḥ* > *pratibhāvaḥ*

102,8-10: the text between <sup>o</sup>sambandhasye<sup>o</sup> and <sup>o</sup>te, tato has been distorted > <sup>o</sup>sambandhasyetyādi / yadi yathokte sambandhe gr̥hīte 'pi liṅgasya punar vyabhicāryavyabhicāritvam apekṣyate, tato ...

105,A1: MV 63, 5-6 > MV 84, 18-19

124,8: <sup>o</sup>artha<sup>o</sup> > <sup>o</sup>artha<sup>o\*</sup>

124,A2: add “<sup>s</sup> don gyis T for <sup>o</sup>artha<sup>o</sup>”

128,A1: <sup>v-v</sup> Ce ? (cf. TS 1693; attributed to Caraka by Śāntarakṣita) > Ce TS 1693 (= Re of Īśvarasena's theorem. Cf. Steinkellner forthc. = MESB XII to appear in WZKS)

131,11: *yātra* > *yātra*\*

131,A2: add “<sup>11</sup> *gañ du T* for *yātra*”

## Bibliography

- AMD Ratnachandra, *An Illustrated Ardha-Magadhi Dictionary*. Vol.II. Indore: Śvetāmbara Sthānakavāsī Jaina Conference 1927 [Reprint: Meicho-fukyū-kai, Tokyo 1977]
- Chu 2004 Junjie Chu, A Study of *Sataimira* in Dignāga's Definition of Pseudo-Perception (PS I.7cd-8ab). *WZKS* 48, 113-149
- Chu 2006 *Id.*, On Dignāga's Theory of the Object of Cognition as Presented in PS(V) 1. *JIABS* 29, 211-253
- Kataoka 2007 Kei Kataoka, *Pramāṇasamuccayaṭīkā* ad [PS(V)] 1.1 wayaku [Japanese translation of PST on PS(V) 1.1]. *SACSt* 2, 1-79
- Kataoka 2011 *Id.*, *Pramāṇasamuccayaṭīkā* ad [PS(V)] I 8cd-10 wayaku [Japanese translation of PST on PS(V) I 8cd-10]. *SACSt* 6, 1-50
- Kyūma 2008 Taiken Kyūma, Jinendrabuddhi ni okeru "i ni yoru chikaku" to "jiko-ninshiki" [*mānasapratyakṣa* and *svasaṃvedana* according to Jinendrabuddhi]. *Ronshū* 13, 91-100
- Muroya forthc. Yasutaka Muroya, The Nyāyamukha and *udghaṭitajña*.
- Steinkellner forthc. Ernst Steinkellner, MESB XII: *anupalabdhi* as *pramāṇāntara*: The opponent in *Tattvasaṅgraha* 1693-1694, or mending a case of philological blind sight, with an appendix: Edition of *Tattvasaṅgraha* 1691-1697 and the *Pañjikā*. *WZKS*
- Yoshida 2010 Akira Yoshida, *Pramāṇasamuccayaṭīkā* 1 *Vādaividhi* hihan shiyaku [A trial translation of the critique of the *Vādaividhi* in *Pramāṇasamuccayaṭīkā* 1]. *Ryūkokudaigaku Bukkyōkenkyū-shitsu Nenpō* 15, 21-53
- Yoshida 2011 *Id.*, *Pramāṇasamuccayaṭīkā* I (ad [PS] I 3c-5 & PSV) wayaku [Japanese translation of PST on PS I 3c-5 & PSV]. *ITK* 15, 134-164

